In 1959, British novelist and scientist C.P. Snow argued that scientists and humanities scholars think in ways so radically different that the disciplines should be considered "Two Cultures" existing separately in Western society. Although Snow's proposition has been widely criticized over the past sixty years, it continues to generate lively debates—with no clear resolutions—as evidenced during last September's Evening Ethics.

Louis Borgenicht, MD, retired pediatrician and associate of the Program in Medical Ethics and Humanities, introduced the discussion, "Does Medical Humanities Still Bridge Only 'Two Cultures'?" As a pre-med student, he had read Snow’s lecture in which the scientist claimed that "[t]he intellectual life of the whole of Western society is increasingly being split into two polar groups…literary intellectuals at one pole—at the other scientists…between the two a gulf of mutual incomprehension." Borgenicht was troubled. I "spent the remainder of my undergraduate career as far away from science as possible," he said, quoting from a 1990 address he delivered to medical students at the University of Utah. Yet, he also realized that "my reaction to Snow's essay…ultimately led me into medicine. Because medicine, being both art and science…clearly bridged the two cultures of science and the humanities." Medicine, Borgenicht believed, integrates different modes of reasoning and accepts the tension between subjective and objective. More importantly, physicians exercise the ability to suspend disbelief so they can accept the patient's view of reality. Physicians must and can accept uncertainty, just as they incorporate social values and ethics into their decision-making process.

In his 2012 article in The American Journal of Medicine, Harvey B. Simon, M.D., agrees. While "explosive discoveries in cell biology, immunology, genetics, and molecular biology, genetics, and molecular" increasingly threaten to "crowd out the art of medicine for busy students and physicians," the Harvard Medical School faculty member cautions us not to diminish the significance of the humanities. "Human health is not well served by 2 cultures that are separate and distinct." Rather, "[s]cientific medicine and the humanities are ideal partners in one culture, the culture of health."

In fact, the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation has supported for ten years a "Culture of Health" initiative with the aim of "shifting the values—and the actions—in the United States so that health becomes a part of everything we do," reports Risa Lavizzo-Mourey, MD, MBA, in the July 2015 issue of Academic Medicine. She points to a well-publicized study that shows the importance of a person's zip code at birth: where someone lives literally can predict their longevity. To help alleviate this problem, the physician advocates "public health be integrated into medical school training."

Education is cited as both the cause and solution to the seismic gap between the two cultures. Martin Kemp, emeritus professor at the University of Oxford, writes in "Dissecting the Two Cultures" in Nature in May 2009: "The issue does not involve two monolithic 'cultures' of science and humanities. It is about the narrow specialization of all disciplines and wider understanding." He argues that "a gulf of understanding has opened up by the time students enter the university. What is needed is an education that inculcates a broad mutual understanding of the nature of the various fields of research, so that we might recognize where their special competence and limitations lie."

While participants at the Evening Ethics Discussion seemed to agree that education in the discipline of medical humanities—or the new, broader version, health humanities—has the potential to bridge the two cultures, they still found grounds for disagreement. How do we measure the effectiveness and value of medical humanities? The controversy illustrated a major claim made by Jerome Kagen in his 2009 book, Three Cultures. Not only are the vocabularies used by scientists and humanities scholars distinctly different; the models of representation used—semantic versus schematic versus mathematical—widen the gaps between the cultures of the humanities, social sciences, and science. The debate continues!
Many faculty members have financial ties to companies that develop and market drugs and devices for use in medical care. These financial relationships arise from speaking fees, service on advisory committees or corporate boards, patents, and equity interests in companies. When a faculty member has a significant financial relationship to an external entity that is related to the faculty member’s research, disclosure of that relationship is required and the institution works with the faculty member to manage, reduce or eliminate any conflicts of interest. This system is considered important to minimize bias in the conduct of research and to maintain trust in the system by which the safety and efficacy of drugs and devices is assessed. But the system is not entirely effective due to inadequate disclosures, failures to follow management plans, weak management plans, and the lack of serious penalties for non-compliance. Further, as the reading illustrates, new challenges are emerging in the form of post-hoc payments from regulated companies to physicians and scientists after they serve on advisory committees to the FDA. This form of payment is entirely unregulated by the system. In the discussion, we will review the key concepts relevant to our approach to conflicts of interest and the ways in which the system is succeeding and failing. Background article to read for this session is “Hidden Conflicts” by Charles Piller, (Science 2018 Jul 6;361(6397):16-20) [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/29976808](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/29976808)
The Program in Medical Ethics and Humanities in the Division of General Internal Medicine, Department of Internal Medicine, University of Utah School of Medicine, and collaborators, The Office of Health Equity, Cancer Health Equity, Center on Aging, School for Cultural and Social Transformation, and Creative Writing Program, invite you to events with:

**Rafael Campo, MD: 2018-19 Lectureship in Medical Humanities**

Rafael Campo, MA, MD, DLitt (hon) is a poet and essayist who teaches and practices internal medicine at Harvard Medical School and Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center in Boston. His primary care practice serves mostly Latinos, gay/lesbian/bisexual/transgendered people, and people with HIV infection. He currently serves as Director of Literature and Writing Programs of the Arts and Humanities Initiative at Harvard Medical School.


There will be two opportunities to hear Rafael Campo:

**Thursday, November 29, 2018**
Evening Ethics Interactive Discussion
"Silences and Last Words: Poetry as Witness at the End of Life"
Officers Club, South Room
5:30-7:30 p.m.
Light refreshments will be served
CME will be offered

For a few short poetry selections from Dr. Campo, as background readings for this session, contact linda.carrlee@hsc.utah.edu

Immediately after this session, the HSEB Bookstore will host a book sale of copies of Rafael Campo’s newest book, *Comfort Measures Only: New and Selected Poems, 1994-2016*, and Dr. Campo will sign his book for you.

**Friday, November 30, 2018**
“Cultural Competence: Poetry and the Importance of Voice in the Illness Experience”
The Tanner Humanities Center's Jewel Box Conference Room
9:00 am-10:00 am
Comfort Measures Only: New and Selected Poems 1994-2016 by Rafael Campo

In *Comfort Measures Only*, his seventh book of poems, Rafael Campo sheds his white coat to reveal the suffering, regret, and ultimately love that many physicians experience caring for patients but few publicly admit. Campo, an internist at Harvard Medical School and Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center in Boston, describes the abject bodies of addicts, the sordid scars of poverty marking marginalized patients. More importantly though, he sees in each person the humanity he shares, giving it voice in language so rich and musical that we as readers know how healing and essential comfort measures—the touch of a hand, a listening ear—are in our increasingly technological and diverse world. These are themes Campo will address when he visits Utah later this month as our inaugural medical humanities scholar. What characterizes Campo’s newest collection is progression. We can trace through his poems the evolution of medical care for HIV and AIDS patients whom Campo, himself a gay man, began treating during his residency in the 1980s. We see the slow foregrounding of diversity in the culture of medicine, which Campo as a Cuban-American is keenly aware of. And we hear the tensions between medicine as science and healing art that Campo continues to wrestle with. To frame our discussion, we will look at the book’s introduction, “Illness as Muse,” and then follow up with your lists of favorite poems. You might begin by reading: “El Curandero,” “The Distant Moon,” “Ten Patients, and Another,” ”Lost in the Hospital,” ”What the Body Told,” ”The Abdominal Exam,” ”from The Changing Face of AIDS,” ”The Couple,” ”The Four Humours,” ”What I Would Give,” ”You Bring Out the Doctor in Me,” ”Absolution,” ”Health,” ”Faith Healing,” ”Iatrogenic,” ”Primary Care,” ”Comfort Measures Only,” ”The Chart,” ”Hippocratic Oath 2.0,” and ”I Imagine Again I Don't Let You Die.”

Dark Matter and the Dinosaurs by Lisa Randall

Lisa Randall’s *Dark Matter and the Dinosaurs* is an extended discussion of cosmology and the natural history of the Earth. A physicist who has written a number of books on science for popular audiences, Randall offers a fairly dense presentation of “dark matter” and the Solar System. She informs us that dark matter makes up 85% of the matter in the universe; we can’t see it, because it doesn’t transmit light, but we know of it because of its slight gravitational Influence. Randall notes that it’s quite possible, though not certain, that the meteoroid that hit the Earth 66 million years ago, leading to the extinction of the dinosaurs, was influenced by the gravity of dark matter. The central portion of Randall’s book is a narrative of how this extraterrestrial cause of mass extinction was discovered by scientists, as well as the discovery of the actual spot on Earth where the impact occurred. This is a dramatic story, and there is much else in Randall’s book to interest humanistically inclined readers. Randall also looks to the future, based on her presentation of the material universe and the Earth’s past, and she encourages us to use scientific knowledge wisely as we face global warming and other environmental threats. *Dark Matter and the Dinosaurs* has great value for those of us who are somewhat intimidated by modern physics, since it represents the current scientific understanding of the cosmos in a generally accessible way. I look forward to our discussion of Randall’s presentation of the science of cosmology—and also to conversations about the humanistic and political implications of what we’ve only recently learned about the universe, based on the astonishing work of the scientific community, perpetrated by the unscrupulous on the unsuspecting, all in the name of medicine and health.

Stay With Me by Ayobami Adebayo

*Stay With Me* tells the story of a young couple in Nigeria who navigate marriage, infertility, and illness amidst familial and cultural expectations that mix ancient ideas and modern sensibilities. Yejide, the narrator, searches for a miracle that will bring the child that she and her husband Akin so badly desire, while her husband’s family seeks the same ending by bringing Akin a second wife. Stay With Me is Nigerian author Ayobami Adebayo’s first novel, and was on the shortlist for the 2018 Wellcome Book Prize, which called it “the heart-breaking tale of what wanting a child can do to a person, a marriage and a family; a powerful and vivid story of what it means to love not wisely but too well.”

The 2018 & 2019 reading schedules can be found on our website at: [http://medicine.utah.edu/internalmedicine/medicaethics/activities/literature/](http://medicine.utah.edu/internalmedicine/medicaethics/activities/literature/)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resident Ethics Conferences</td>
<td>12:30-1:15 pm</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Personalized Medicine  
  VAMC: Erin Rothwell, PhD  
  UUMC Cartwright Conference room: Jeffrey Botkin, MD, MPH |
| *Evening Ethics* | Tue. Dec 4 - Wed. Dec 12 | |  
5:30-7:00 pm  
U of U RAB #117  
- *Hidden and not-so-hidden conflicts of interest: how much should we care?* Facilitated by Jeffrey Botkin, MD, MPH  
5:30-7:30 p.m. Officers Club, South Room  
- *Silences and Last Words: Poetry as Witness at the End of Life with Rafael Campo, MA, MD, DLitt (Hon)* |
| 2018-19 Lectureship in Medical Humanities | Fri. Nov 30 | The Tanner Humanities Center’s Jewel Box Conference Room | 9:00 am-10:00 am  
- *Cultural Competence: Poetry and the Importance of Voice in the Illness Experience with Rafael Campo, MA, MD, DLitt (Hon)* |
| Utah Law Review Symposium | Fri. Nov 30 | |  
- *The Opioid Crisis: Paths Forward to Mitigate Regulatory Failure* |
| *The Physicians Literature and Medicine Discussion Group* | Wed. Nov 14 - Wed. Dec 12 - Wed. Jan 9 | U of U Hospital Large Conference Room #W1220 | 6:00-8:30 pm  
- *Comfort Measures Only: New and Selected Poems 1994-2016 by Rafael Campo* Facilitated by Susan Sample, PhD, MFA  
- *Dark Matter and the Dinosaurs by Lisa Randall* Facilitated by Mark Matheson, PhD, MA  
- *Stay with Me by Ayobami Adebayo* Facilitated by Gretchen Case, PhD, MA |
| Internal Medicine Grand Rounds | Thurs. Jan 10 | SOM Class Room A | 12:00-1:00 p.m.  
- *The return of individual research results: ethical, regulatory and practical challenges* “with Jeffrey Botkin, MD, MPH* |

---

**Keep The Date**

Please join us for these two events  
By our 2019 David Green Speaker: **Jeffrey R. Botkin, MD, MPH**

**Biobanking Newborn Bloodspots: Henrietta Lacks Revisited**  
February 21, 2019, 8am, Pediatric Grand Rounds, David Green Lectureship, Primary Children’s Hospital, 3rd floor Auditorium

**Evening Ethics: Informed consent: enduring challenges and opportunities**  
February 20, 2019, 5:30-7:00 pm, Research Administration Building, Rm. #117

---

**Utah Law Review Symposium**  
**The Opioid Crisis: Paths Forward to Mitigate Regulatory Failure**  
Friday, November 30, 2018  
8:00 a.m. – 3:30 p.m., S.J. Quinney College of Law, Level 6
PROGRAM IN MEDICAL ETHICS
AND HUMANITIES

Division Faculty:
Margaret P. Battin, M.F.A., Ph.D
Jeffrey R. Botkin, MD, M.P.H.
Samuel M. Brown, MD, M.S.
Teneille R. Brown, JD
Gretchen A. Case, Ph.D, MA
Leslie P. Francis, Ph.D, J.D.
Brent Kious, MD, Ph.D
Erin Rothwell, Ph.D
Jim Ruble, PharmD, JD
Susan Sample, Ph.D, M.F.A.
Jill Sweney, MD, MBA
James Tabery, M.D. (Emeritus)

Program Associates:
Howard Mann, MD
Mark Matheson, D. Phil.

Division Associates:
Rebecca Anderson, RN, Ph.D
Philip L. Baese, M.D
Louis Borgenicht, M.D.
Maureen Henry, JD
Thomas Schenkenberg, Ph.D

Academic Program Manager:
Linda Carr-Lee Faix, M.A., Ph.C

Executive Assistant:
Heather Sudbury
Phone: (801) 581-7170 or (801) 587-5884
Fax: (801) 585-9588

PROGRAM MEMBERS ON THE ROAD AND IN PRINT

- **Gretchen Case** gave a lecture entitled “Visual Arts for the Healing Arts” at Cedars-Sinai Hospital Center for Healthcare Ethics in Los Angeles on October 17. The same week, she attended the annual meeting of the American Society of Bioethics and Humanities, which was held at Disneyland (!), and she will chair the program committee for next year’s annual meeting in Pittsburgh in October 2019.

- On September 20th, **Susan Sample** was the guest speaker at the BYU Medical Humanities Club. On October 12th, she presented a poster, "Echoes of Mortality: How a Patient’s Poetic Narrative Expands Understanding of Dying Well,” at the 2018 Mountain West Regional Meeting, Society for General Internal Medicine, Salt Lake City.

- **Susan Sample’s** poem, "Famine Cottage," was selected by Paul Muldoon, former poetry editor of The New Yorker, as winner of the Shirley McClure Poetry Contest, sponsored by the 2018 Irish Arts & Writers Festival held in California. [https://irishwriterslosgatos.com/2018-writing-contest/](https://irishwriterslosgatos.com/2018-writing-contest/)

- In October, **Teneille Brown** presented a poster at the Psychiatric Genetics conference in Scotland on the Legal Duty to Warn of Psychiatric Genetic Findings.

- **Peggy Battin** was at Sea Ranch, California, September 26-30, hosting a panel with the actors after 4 nights of production of the play by Julie Jensen, WINTER, inspired by Peggy's short story "Robeck" about old age and right-to-die issues.

- **Sam Brown's** new book on the metaphysics of translation in early Mormonism is now under contract with Oxford UP. Also, The Center for Humanizing Care, of which Sam Brown is founder and director, has received a DoD grant to study post intensive care syndrome.

- In October, **Sam Brown** gave Critical Care Grand Rounds at University of Pittsburgh: "Intensive Care for Human Beings". He and colleagues also published an ethics essay thinking carefully about the risks of using functional outcomes data in the ICU to guide cessation of life support. [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30247240](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30247240)

- **Leslie Francis** presented at the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities (ASBH)—on the panel discussion for the medicine and law affinity group, on forensic uses of non-forensic genetic data bases, such as Ancestry.com or 23 and me.